

# MAINE STATE LEGISLATURE

The following document is provided by the  
**LAW AND LEGISLATIVE DIGITAL LIBRARY**  
at the Maine State Law and Legislative Reference Library  
<http://legislature.maine.gov/lawlib>



Reproduced from scanned originals with text recognition applied  
(searchable text may contain some errors and/or omissions)

**This document is from the files of the Office of  
the Maine Attorney General as transferred to  
the Maine State Law and Legislative Reference  
Library on January 19, 2022**

# STATE OF MAINE

Inter-Departmental Memorandum Date November 8, 1963

To Ernest H. Johnson, State Tax Assessor Dept. Bureau of Taxation  
From John R. Doyle, Asst. Attorney General Dept. " " "  
Subject R.S., C. 17, s. 2, def. "sale price"--"allowances . . . pursuant to warranty."

## FACTS:

An assessment against Richard D. Gilman, Sr., Reg. #78012, is presently pending reconsideration. The assessment is based upon the purchase of a tractor by Gilman from Chadwick-Baross. The tractor apparently proved unsatisfactory, as a result of which we understand the manufacturer, through Chadwick-Baross, agreed to take back the machine; but while certain credit was given on the return, the full purchase price was not refunded.

Mr. Gilman's attorney, [James A. Bishop], contends that the credits in question were given "pursuant to warranty"; and that even if it cannot be shown that there was an express written warranty, nevertheless the implied warranty referred to in section 15 of chapter 156 (the Uniform Sales Act) applies.

## QUESTION:

Whether the language in the definition of "sale price" in section 2 of Chapter 17--"sale price" shall not include allowances in cash or by credit made upon the return of merchandise pursuant to warranty"--refers as well to the implied warranty set forth in section 15 of the Uniform Sales Act as it does to an express warranty.

## ANSWER:

Yes.

## REASONS:

Warranty defined.

Ernest H. Johnson, State Tax Assessor      November 8, 1963

"An affirmation of fact or a representation is a 'warranty,' and not merely evidence of a warranty, if natural tendency is to induce the buyer to purchase the goods and the buyer thus induced does purchase them." 44 A Words and Phrases, p. 599.

"Warranty is an engagement or undertaking, express or implied, that a certain fact regarding the subject of a contract is or shall be as it is expressly or impliedly declared or promised to be." Christian v. City of Eugene, 89 Pac. 419. Citing Webster's International Dictionary. 44 A Words and Phrases, p. 598. (Emphasis supplied).

It is well established that no particular words are required to constitute a warranty.

"To constitute a warranty words 'warranty' or 'guarantee' need not be used." 44 A Words and Phrases, p. 642.

This is true of an implied warranty as it is of an express warranty.

Under the Uniform Sales Act as found in the Maine Revised Statutes, Volume 4, Chapter 183, sections 13 through 16, there are several forms of implied warranties, briefly, in section 13 there is a provision for implied warranty of title, in section 14 an implied warranty in sale by description; an implied warranty of quality in section 15 and an implied warranty in sale by sample as enumerated in section 16.

Section 15 which is of importance here provides:

"Subject to the provisions of this chapter and to any statute in that behalf, there is no implied warranty or condition as to the quality or fitness for any particular purpose of goods supplied under a contract to sell or a sale, except as follows: (Emphasis supplied). 1. Where the buyer, expressly or by implication, makes known to the seller the particular purpose for which the goods are required, and it appears that the buyer relies on the seller's skill or

Ernest H. Johnson, State Tax Assessor

November 8, 1963

or judgment, whether he be the grower or manufacturer or not, there is an implied warranty that the goods shall be reasonably fit for such purpose."

The case of *Ross v. Diamond Watch Co.*, 149 Mo. 350 decided under the above section lays down what a claimant must prove to support recovery. 1. That he made known to the seller the particular purpose for which the goods were required; 2. that he relied upon the seller's skill or judgment; 3. that he used the goods purchased for the particular purpose which he made known to the seller; 4. that the goods were not reasonably fit for the purpose disclosed to the seller; and 5. that he suffered damage by breach of the implied warranty.

Sec. 15 continued.

"II. When the goods are bought by description from the seller who deals in goods of description, whether he be the grower or manufacturer or not, there is an implied warranty that the goods shall be of merchantable quality.

III. When the buyer has examined the goods, there is no implied warranty as regards defects which such examination ought to have revealed.

IV. In the case of a contract to sell or a sale of a specified article under its patent or other trade name, there is no implied warranty as to its fitness for any particular purpose.

(However, it does not follow that if an article purchased has a trade name and that it is bought thereunder, the buyer does not rely on the skill or judgment of the seller. See *Ross v. Porteous, Mitchell & Braun Co.*, 136 Mo. 118).

V. An implied warranty or condition as to the quality or fitness for a particular purpose may be annexed by the usage of trade.

VI. An expressed warranty or condition does not negative a warranty or condition implied under the provisions of this chapter unless inconsistent therewith."

Ernest H. Johnson, State Tax Assessor      November 8, 1963

I assume the instances will be many where the vendor or vendee or both rely upon a situation wherein there is a return of goods pursuant to an implied warranty under sec. 15 and particularly subsection 1. Since the decision as to whether or not there is an implied warranty is largely a factual one and is usually made as between the parties to a transaction, that is, the vendor and vendee, I would suggest that administrative guide lines be laid down providing that certain facts be established before there will be a finding by the Bureau of Taxation that an implied warranty exists.

I would recommend that the guide lines laid down in *Ross v. Diamond Match* above cited be utilized in establishing an administrative rule, with the addition thereto of the elements of allowance and return.

It would therefore seem that the definition of warranty as contained in Chapter 17, section 2 includes implied warranties. However, there must be a factual situation such as would give rise to an implied warranty under the Uniform Sales Act--that is, a situation under section 15 or any other appropriate section wherein the vendee has placed reliance in the vendor as to the quality or the fitness of the goods and the vendee furnishes the goods which are later found to be defective and are returned because of the defect to the original vendor.

JRD:epd

# STATE OF MAINE

Inter-Departmental Memorandum Date November 6, 1963

To Jon R. Doyle, Assistant Attorney General Dept. Bureau of Taxation

From Ernest H. Johnson, State Tax Assessor Dept. " " "

Subject R.S., G. 17, s. 2, def. "sale price"--"allowances . . . pursuant to warranty."

An assessment against Richard D. Gilman, Sr., Reg. #78612 is presently pending reconsideration. The assessment is based upon the purchase of a tractor by Gilman from Chadwick-Baloss. The tractor apparently proved unsatisfactory, as a result of which we understand the manufacturer, through Chadwick-Baloss, agreed to take back the machine; but while certain credit was given on the return, the full purchase price was not refunded.

Mr. Gilman's attorney, James A. Bishop, contends that the credits in question were given "pursuant to warranty"; and that <sup>even</sup> it cannot be shown that there was an express written warranty, nevertheless the implied warranty referred to in section 15 of Chapter 185 (the Uniform Sales Act) applies.

This raises a question of considerable importance in sales tax matters, namely, whether the language in the definition of "sale price" in section 2 of Chapter 17--"sale price" shall not include allowances in cash or by credit made upon the return of merchandise pursuant to warranty"--refers as well to the implied warranty set forth in section 15 of the Uniform Sales Act, as it does to an express warranty.

EHJ:epd